



Edmond de Rothschild Foundation (Israel)

The Edmond de Rothschild Research Series

A collection of studies in the area of:

Access to and Success in Higher Education

2018

The Edmond de Rothschild Research Series

A collection of studies in the area of:

Access to and Success in Higher Education

2018

Dear Partners,

The Edmond de Rothschild Foundation (Israel) is spearheading philanthropic dedication to building an inclusive society by promoting excellence, diversity and leadership through higher education. Catalyzing true change and developing a cohesive society through dozens of innovative projects across the country, the Foundation provides growth and empowerment opportunities to the many communities in Israel. We develop and support novel solutions and creative partnerships, while evaluating result-driven programs with true social impact.

In keeping with its philosophy of strategic philanthropy, the Foundation established the **Edmond de Rothschild Research Series**, to promote excellence in research and expand the knowledge in the Foundation's areas of interest. The booklet before you centers on **Access to and Success in Higher Education**, as part of the first research series which focused on three main areas:

- 1. Access to and Success in Higher Education:** As part of its efforts to reduce social gaps, the Foundation strives to insure access to and success in higher education for periphery populations. It supports programs aimed at improving access to higher education options through preparation and guidance, reducing academic student dropout rates, and translating graduates' education into commensurate employment.
- 2. Measurement and Evaluation:** The Foundation seeks to constantly enhance its social impact and therefore, emphasizes measurement and evaluation of the projects it supports according to predefined, coherent criteria. The Foundation encourages evaluation as a continuous process that follows the course of programs from the planning stage and throughout their operation, and promotes the development of systematic data collection and analysis tools for all program aspects.
- 3. Baron de Rothschild's ("Hanadiv's") Legacy:** The Foundation is the expression of the Rothschild family's long-term commitment to the pioneering spirit of Israel. Harnessing a philanthropic legacy of more than 130 years, we are investing in groundbreaking agents of change and fostering modern-day pioneering in Israel.

A call for proposals was sent out to Israel's higher education institutions; academic steering committees were established in all three areas; and a total of 13 research proposals were approved. The researchers created new knowledge and distributed it, between the years 2014-2016, through various academic and non-academic channels. With the conclusion of the project, we are presenting summaries of all the completed studies and their main findings. The full publications of these studies can be found on the Foundation's website: www.rcf.org.il.

We would like to thank all the researchers from Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Tel Aviv University, the University of Haifa, Bar-Ilan University, the Open University, Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute, and the Center for Educational Technology, who participated in this research series.

Enjoy your reading,

Elli Booch

Director of Philanthropy

Vardit Gilor

Program Officer

Table of Contents:

Social Gaps in Academic Studies: Accessibility to Institutions, Fields of Study, and Bachelor's Degrees Completion

8-11

*Dr. Yariv Feniger, Department of Education, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev
Prof. Hanna Ayalon, Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Tel Aviv University
Oded Mcdossi, School of Education, Tel Aviv University*

Arab-Bedouin Women in the Israeli Workforce

12-17

Dr. Sarab Abu-Rabia-Queder, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev

Ultra-Orthodox Women's Integration into Higher Education and the Workplace

18-24

*Dr. Varda Wasserman, the Open University of Israel
Dr. Michal Frenkel, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem*

Combining Education and Work among Israeli Students

26-31

Prof. Rachel Gali Cinamon, Tel Aviv University

The Long-Term Effects of Student Participation in Scholarship Programs that combine Social Activism

32-37

*Prof. Daphna Golan, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem
Dr. Limor Goldner, University of Haifa*

Social Gaps in Academic Studies: Accessibility to Institutions, Fields of Study, and Bachelor's Degrees Completion

Dr. Yariv Feniger, Department of Education,

Ben-Gurion University of the Negev

Prof. Hanna Ayalon, Department of Sociology and Anthropology,

Tel Aviv University

Oded Mcdossi, School of Education, Tel Aviv University

Purpose and contribution of the study

Academic education is instrumental in achieving successful integration into the modern workplace, civic involvement, and a socially and culturally enriched adult life. Comprehensive research on various aspects of inequality in access to higher education conducted since the 1960s shows that the rapid expansion of higher-education systems over the recent decades has improved, to a certain extent, access of peripheral social groups to academic degrees – but, in many cases, their entry into higher education was mainly made possible into institutions and areas of study of lesser prestige and demand.

As a result of these processes, it is customary to distinguish between two dimensions of inequality in higher education: vertical inequality and horizontal inequality. Vertical inequality is reflected in the continuation of studies and the attainment of degrees (undergraduate, graduate, and doctoral) and the horizontal inequality refers to different types of diplomas within the same education level, such as differences between diplomas of more and less prestigious institutions, and differences between various fields of study. In the last two decades, research on all aspects and implications for labor mobility processes of horizontal inequality has significantly developed. In general, the body of this research suggests that strong social groups take advantage of the horizontal differentiation in the field of higher education towards preserving their relative advantages in the labor market.

The available literature provides a long list of factors that may explain inequality in access to higher education and the selection of institutions and fields of study. In general, these factors can be divided into three main types: Factors related to family resources; factors related to schools' modes of operation, especially in high school; and factors related to higher-education institutions and the admission requirements. Like other research, the current study cannot examine all of these aspects; the data on which it is based allows us to focus on some of the family resources (parents' education, number of siblings, and economic status), achievements in high school, and psychometric exam achievements.

The purpose of this research is to examine social gaps in the attainment of a bachelor's degree in institutions of higher education in Israel. In order to examine these gaps, we created and analyzed a data file that enables monitoring a large sample of young people from the high-school stage, through admission to higher-education institutions, to the completion of a bachelor's degree. For the first time in Israel, this analysis provides a broad and multidimensional picture of educational inequality.

The research focused on three main research questions:

1. What are the differences between dominant groups in Israeli society (veteran Jews, sons and daughters of educated parents) and excluded groups (new immigrants, Arabs, sons and daughters of parents without higher education) at the entrance to higher education?
2. What are the differences between dominant groups and excluded groups in terms of access to high (Israeli) labor-market value?
3. What are the differences between dominant and excluded groups in the chances of obtaining a degree within a specified period from the beginning of studies, and between different institutions and fields of study?

Four main innovations are presented by this research, with respect to existing literature on inequality in higher education in Israel. First, studies conducted so far in Israel on inequality in higher education were cross-sectional studies that focused on one point (typically, on the stage of admission or graduation). The present study provides a longitudinal perspective on the process of acquiring a bachelor's degree, thus showing where, along this process, social gaps are formed and whether these gaps differ at different points in time. The second innovation this work introduces is that while previous research tended to focus only on one dimension of inequality in entering higher education – vertical, i.e., transition from high school to higher education, or horizontal, i.e., transition between institutions and fields of study, this study examined both dimensions together. Thirdly, the research examines the various fields of academic studies in the context of their value in the Israeli labor market. Finally, this research also addresses the question of social inequality in completing bachelor's degrees.

The research method

The data file that served as the basis for this study was prepared by Israel's Central Bureau of Statistics. It combines data from the 1995 Population Census; the Ministry of Education's matriculation exam files; the National Center for Measurement and Evaluation, which is responsible for the psychometric exam; and data from various institutions of higher education, concerning the beginning and end dates of the bachelor's degree studies.

Analysis was performed in two stages. In the first stage, gaps in the entrance to higher education and in the selection of fields of study and educational institutions were examined, with reference to the value of these choices in the labor market. In the second stage, the completion of the degree by those entering higher-education institutions was examined. We distinguish between four situations: Completing the degree within the standard period, prolonging the studies beyond the standard period ("protracted degree"), discontinuing the studies before the ending of the standard period (dropout), and moving to a different institution. Transferring to another institution is usually associated with an extension of the studies but does not express dropout or protracted degree – rather, it is usually linked to the student's incompatibility with the chosen institution or field.

Main findings and their significance

Gaps in admission to higher education and access to curricula with high labor-market value

Very large gaps were found in access to higher education between Jews and Arabs, as well as between Israeli-Ethiopian and the other Jewish groups. The gap between Jews and Arabs could not be explained by differences in the socioeconomic background and previous achievements. We hypothesize that one of the reasons for this disparity is the structure of the Israeli labor market, which does not encourage Arab high-school graduates to acquire academic degrees because of its inherent discrimination. While the gap between Mizrahi Jews and Ashkenazi Jews upon entry to higher education is not negligible, it disappears once previous achievement variables were controlled. On the other hand, the gap against immigrants from the former Soviet Union, in comparison with veteran Ashkenazi Jews, does not disappear even after variable control. Children of educated parents have an advantage in access to higher education even after controlling for other socioeconomic variables and previous achievements. This finding may be explained by the gaps in social and cultural capital which we could not measure in this study.

As in other studies, our research also shows that the expansion of higher education is not a sufficient condition for closing gaps. In order to reduce gaps in higher education, action must be taken to diminish the gaps in earlier stages. However, our findings indicate that the gaps between Jews and Arabs in accessibility to higher-education are profound and do not derive from a cumulative educational inequality by itself.

Large disparities in access to areas of high labor-market value were found mainly between Jews and Arabs. The research also pointed to a large gap between immigrants from Ethiopia and veteran Jews. Immigrants from the former Soviet Union had an advantage over all other groups in acquiring an education with a high economic return. Among the veteran Jewish population, there were no significant differences between the groups, and after controlling other variables, an advantage was found for Mizrahi over Ashkenazi Jews. In addition, children of educated parents were not found to pursue fields of study that lead to high income at higher rates (after controlling for other variables, this finding was reversed). A possible explanation is that children of educated parents are more likely to pursue fields associated with cultural capital, while those who grew up in homes without higher education seek more economic mobility through higher education.

Gaining a better grasp of the gaps in entrance to higher education and the choice of fields and institutions of study requires an investment in research that directly examines the considerations young people in Israel make in their transition from high school to higher education. The findings of this study indicate a potential for intervention programs to encourage the acquisition of higher education in Arab society, combined with opening employment opportunities for these graduates. This is also true of young Israeli-Ethiopians, who are in a situation similar to that of the Arab population in terms of access to higher education and areas of high economic value. The study points to an unfavorable gap in former Soviet Union immigrants' entry to higher education, despite their being a relatively strong group in terms of education, parts of which actually take advantage of education towards economic mobility. We believe further research is needed to elucidate the reasons for this gap. It may be connected with a relatively early entry into the workforce, through the technicians / practical engineers track.

Gaps in the possibilities of obtaining a bachelor's degree within a specified period from the beginning of studies

We found that students from excluded groups suffer from higher dropout and degree protraction rates than students from dominant groups in society. Here, too, the phenomenon was found particularly significant among Arab students. One central explanation cites language difficulties and difficulties in integrating into a culturally different learning environment. In addition, it was found that Israeli-Ethiopian students are at greater risk than veteran Jews, both in terms of dropping out and degree protraction. The gap between immigrants from the former Soviet Union and veteran Israeli Jews was relatively small and less significant compared with differences in access to higher education, and no gaps were found between ethnic groups within the veteran Jewish population. The research indicates that high-school achievements (although not curricular track) are linked to the likelihood of dropping out of academic studies or protracting the degree. We found considerable differences among educational institutions and fields of study in dropout and degree protraction rates. The most prominent findings were the particularly high dropout rates in colleges specializing in teacher education and public colleges. By contrast, private colleges have the highest rates of degree completion on time. In relation to fields of study, we found that humanities and arts students run the highest risk of dropping out and protracting their degrees; students in allied health fields and law school – the lowest.

The research findings indicate that social inequality in higher education does not stop at accessibility to education and also spans the completion of studies. The weaker groups in Israeli society, Arabs and Jews of Ethiopian origin, face inferiority, both in terms of the vertical and horizontal dimensions upon entry to academic education, and in their chances to complete their studies within the accepted period of time. Therefore, policies or intervention programs that focus on these groups should take into account the different aspects of inequality. Regarding the Arab group, we believe that the possibility of providing preparatory courses to those students who meet the threshold conditions of higher-education institutions should be considered. Such a preparatory program would assist accepted individuals to improve the levels of their Hebrew and English and facilitate the transition to an educational institution that is dominated by Jewish culture. It is crucial that such a preparatory program would focus not only on the academic aspect, but also on the social aspects of higher education, and enable a meeting of Jewish and Arab students. In addition, we believe that in light of the high dropout rates among Arab and Israeli-Ethiopian students, it is important that institutions of higher education would give greater attention to accompanying students from these groups, especially in their first year.

In Israel, as elsewhere, higher education expands through institutional diversification. The current study shows that public colleges and colleges specializing in teacher education, which have been a major component of the system's expansion over the last two decades, are a source of concern due to the high dropout rates found in them. These colleges absorb students who, on average, have lower previous achievements than those of university students, and are therefore more likely to be unsuccessful. However, the gap perseveres even after taking into account previous achievements, and there seem to be additional reasons for the high dropout rates. In light of the study's findings, it is recommended to continue examining this issue in order to better understand the causes of this problem. At the same time, policy and intervention programs should be developed to reduce these colleges' dropout rates. The private colleges, by contrast, provide a path of study with high chances of success to those who can afford the costs they incur.

Arab-Bedouin Women in the Israeli Workforce

Dr. Sarab Abu-Rabia-Queder, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev

Purpose and contribution of the study

Sociologists of work and employment have demonstrated that women's participation in the labor market contributes significantly to improving their status, both at home and in society. According to this approach, women's access to economic power sources is positively correlated with gender equality. Paid employment, as a key factor in strengthening women's power in the family and the community, is a tool through which patriarchal relations at home and in the workplace are challenged and has been perceived as a catalyst for greater political participation. Moreover, women's entry into public employment has also been associated with a decline in the level of domestic violence and an increase in human capital, and therefore contributes significantly to women's independence and empowerment. However, these encouraging levels are adversely affected by structural barriers – racial, ethnic, class-related, and gender-related power structures – which intersect and create an inequality towards women from minority groups.

The purpose of this study is to unravel the unique power structures at work in the lives of academically educated and employed Bedouin women in the Negev Region in southern Israel, and how the intersectionality of these power structures leads to employment inequality among this population in a given historical context. The study addresses the question of how various intersecting social divisions are subjectively experienced in their daily professional lives in terms of inclusion and exclusion, discrimination and disadvantage.

In Arab society in general and in Bedouin society in particular, the home, family, tribe, and community are intertwined, and therefore it is important to question the division between "home" and "public" spaces. This study considers the nuclear family, extended family, and the rural or urban community as the private arena; the public arena is divided into three separate arenas: the dominant arena (the Jewish labor market), the ethnic arena (the Bedouin-Arab labor market), and the tribal arena. Women's entry into these public arenas has complex implications: it challenges the power relations between the private and public spaces, challenges the ethnic-national relations (between an Arab minority and a Jewish majority), alters the gender power relations (between women and men in the domestic and employment worlds), and questions the tribal power relations (between the control of the individual versus the collective).

This examination is conducted through the subjective experience dimension, in two aspects: discrimination and agency. In the discrimination aspect, the so-called "penalties" imposed on women working in the public-employment sector are examined. Four penalties are revealed: The ethnic-national penalty (ethnic discrimination), the religious penalty (religious discrimination), the gender penalty (gender discrimination), and the tribal penalty (discrimination on the grounds of tribal affiliation or the friction between professional

ethics and the tribal code). These penalties redefine the meaning of private and public space in Naqab Arab-Bedouin society, and outline "private" and "public" spaces in the lives of women who are part of an ethnic-national, religious, gender, and tribal minority. In addition, in presenting the disadvantages of working in the Arab-Bedouin sector and the advantages of working in the Jewish sector, these new definitions challenge the advantages and disadvantages of the dominant labor market and the ethnic labor market.

The agency aspect reveals the ways in which women cope with "private" and "public" spaces while examining the strategies they operate in order to balance these spaces. While many of the women "balance" by assuming "double roles" at home and at work, others try to do so by assimilating the professional knowledge of the working life into the "private" circles of their lives, thereby improving their marital, family, and community status. Their economic and professional contribution is perceived as necessary and therefore also legitimate in the assimilation of a new maternal and female model in Bedouin society, which is not exempt from exclusion and criticism. In their view, the profession is thus perceived as an arena for challenging and questioning gender norms in Bedouin society, and as an arena for challenging their stereotypical representation as perceived by the Jewish public.

The presence in the professional sphere of professional Arab-Bedouin women with economic, human, social, and symbolic capital challenges, in effect, gender and ethnic power relations. Their presence establishes a new class identity, which is forced to struggle against a false class consciousness among the ethno-colonial and patriarchal hegemonic groups, who attempt to limit the public-sphere recognition of this identity.

However, this new class identity succeeds to establish, despite the conflict, recognition and prestige in the domestic arena.

The discussion of the new class identity established by these women highlights the importance of looking at Arab women in the Negev through the class lens. Intersectional analysis enables us to break down the cultural-essentialist category characterizing the study of Bedouin women – especially professional Bedouin women – and the discussion of class is a central axis that emerges from this analysis, enabling us to deconstruct the dominant analysis axes that have characterized the study of the Negev's Bedouin women: The ethnic lens (a category of minority) and the gender lens (women in an oppressive society). These two lenses may also be useful in research on women from other ethnic minority groups, but could trap them only on these axes, without an opportunity to develop additional categories that may emerge from a multiple-axes study of women or minorities. From a broader perspective, the intersectional analysis allows us to question essentialist categories, especially in terms of gender and governance, both "from below" – by dismantling essentialist categories used to characterize subordinate populations, and "from above" – by questioning the "enlightenment" of those who generate the discourse and hold power.

This study enriches the literature on the employment of women and minorities in three respects. First, in the context of the chief category examined – professional Arab-Bedouin women – and an a priori assumption of a link between academic education and equal work participation, the study presents a paradox between these women's possession of the highest capital in their society – comparable to that of Arab-Bedouin professional men and Jewish men and women – and their marginalization. Second, it reveals another mode of discrimination called tribal penalty, resulting from a clash between tribal and professional codes (reinforced by Israeli institutions), that has not been discussed in literature on minority

and employment to date. This penalty not only endangers Arab-Bedouin professional women's jobs but also places their clients (women and children) at risk. Third, it questions the advantages of ethnic economic enclaves for minority women by showing how unsafe this space is for professional women, who will be unable to manifest their professionalism to the fullest as tribal-patriarchal contract and threats penetrate this realm.

The research is based on the qualitative approach, which makes a considerable contribution in explaining phenomena that the quantitative approach explains only in a limited way. Most of the studies conducted on Bedouin or Arab women in the employment market applied the quantitative approach, which mainly indicates statistical differences between various groups. While this method shows differences between ethnic minority groups and the majority group and that there is an ethnic or another penalty, it fails to identify the mechanisms that establish these differences. Therefore, the narrative methodology is needed to complete the picture and offer comprehensive, detailed, and diverse explanations.

The research method

The study's sample population consists of 50 college-educated Arab-Bedouin women, both married with children and single, in their mid-20s to mid-30s, employed in the public sector in Arab-Bedouin localities and nearby Jewish towns. They include teachers, school counselors, social workers, nurses, physicians, scientists, researchers, lecturers, attorneys, psychologists, school principals, and pharmacists who have been employed for the past 5-10 years.

Focus on the last generation originates in the numerous social changes that affect Arab-Bedouin society in the Negev, especially with regards to all that concerns the employment of women; and in the desire to present as up-to-date a picture as possible of the political and social changes and of the manner in which these are reflected in the integration of women in the public sector. The literature attests to a disparity between the integration of first- and second-generation immigrant women (Muslims or from other minority groups) in favor of the second group, comprising women born in their country of residence, albeit to a lesser extent than the majority group. In the Bedouin context, we should pay particular attention to the integration of second-generation women, who were born into an urban reality and have already been employed in the labor market over the past 5-10 years.

This group of professional women is part of the growing middle class in Naqab Bedouin society. Although their average wage is higher than the average wage in the Bedouin society, and their average number of children (2-3) is lower than the 7.1 Bedouin average (according to the 2010 Statistical Yearbook), they remain a small minority group in own society, accounting for 5% of the Bedouin society (2010-2011 data), compared to 9% in Arab society in Israel and 49.9% in the Jewish sector.

The author – a member of the Bedouin society in the Negev who has served as a faculty member at Ben-Gurion University for years – is well acquainted with the Bedouin population, especially with Bedouin women. Thus, it was not difficult for her to locate the women and convince them to agree to be interviewed. While she conducted some of the initial interviews herself, the were mainly conducted by research assistants.

Data were collected through two-part semi-structured narrative interviews, the first part of which focused on personal background questions, such as age, number of years of schooling,

number of years of work, marital status, number of children, workplace and residence (Arab or Jewish). The second part of the interviews solicited educational and occupational narratives, asking open questions about the women's choices with relation to field of study and occupation, their gender and ethnic status as students, and difficulties or challenges during the period of study; and their choice of workplace, the recruitment process, and difficulties and challenges at work and at home.

The interviews were analyzed in a thematic analysis according to grounded theory procedure. The data were coded into derived categories and subcategories in two primary layers: discrimination and agency. Discrimination includes two time axes – professional choice and the various penalties experienced in the workplace – while agency includes the strategies women employ to negotiate between their public and private lives.

Data analysis in qualitative research is aimed at injecting meaning and interpretation into the studied phenomenon and revealing patterns of action and insights on processes that would eventually enable the researcher to link findings to theory. It is an inductive process, i.e., following initial data (pilot) analysis, the research questions are tuned and adjusted. The method is based mainly on locating, naming and characterizing repetitions in the raw material and an attempt to construct a theoretical model that summarizes and explains the investigated reality. The theory anchored in the field assumes that "all people who have common living circumstances also have common social and psychological patterns" (ibid., p. 200). I argue that although academic Bedouin women working in the public sphere share some patterns, there are also differences, and the research is aimed at tracing the main patterns relating to their combined marginalization and ways of coping with the fragmented labor market space, and, at the same time, characterizing the types of barriers in the way of women and strategies for integration into the Israeli labor market .

Main findings and their significance

The narratives of educated working women in the Arab-Bedouin society in the Negev prompt a discussion of two central aspects of the issue of women and work. The first of these is that Arab women's entry into the public arena undermines the balance between the public and domestic space in relation to their traditional home-roles, thus calling for a discussion of the multi-dimensional intersectional oppressive structures – i.e., gender, racism, religion, and tribe which these women face as a result of changing the balance. This discussion brings to light literature on women, minorities, and employment and helps to clarify the oppression structures and unique penalties imposed on women under triple oppression – patriarchal, national, and tribal.

It is important to understand that by targeting support professionals (nurses, attorneys, social workers, and counselors), the oppressive structures diminish their ability to provide treatment and assistance to society's most disadvantaged women, thus also compromising at-risk individuals.

Alongside this oppression, the presence of working women in various public arenas – the Jewish, the Arab, and the tribal – also challenges the ethnic and gender power relations, as well as those between private and public arenas.

The educated women employed in positions in their academic fields actually enjoy the highest hierarchical status among women in Bedouin society, since they have succeeded

in breaking boundaries and have access to financial resources. At the same time, they are also trapped within a broad matrix of structured social divisions – of gender, tribe, ethnicity. These intersecting power structures trap the women within a liminal space – as women in a patriarchal society; as members of a tribal society; as Arab Muslims in a racist society – and throughout, they are subject to exclusion and nonbelonging.

The paradox of their being the most educated group of their society while being trapped in a liminal space posits a glass ceiling obstructing their professional advancement. According to the Glass Ceiling Commission (1991-1996), the term “glass ceiling” refers to “those artificial barriers based on attitudinal or organizational bias that prevents qualified individuals from advancing upward in their organization into management-level positions.” Such discrimination does not bar the advancement of men of the minority group.

This places Bedouin women in the most marginal space in comparison to their colleagues from the dominant group, but also in comparison to male colleagues from their own ethnic-national group. Thus, even when they invest in education and go out to work in the public employment space, Bedouin women remain marginalized in comparison to working Bedouin men and Jews (men and women).

The women working within Bedouin society are subject to tribal norms, which penetrate the public-ethnic employment arena and effect women’s exclusion from the ethnic-economic arena. But their presence in the Jewish public arena is even more challenging, as they epitomize not only an ethnic-national minority, but also a religious group at times perceived as a threat to the “modern” and “democratic” foundations of western liberalism with which Israel identifies. As a result, these women, having broken through the barriers of social and ethnic margins in order to get to the center, that is, the dominant public-employment arena, find themselves excluded there, as well. Once again, their exclusion generates marginality, nonbelonging, and alienation to such a degree that some trained professionals (social workers) forego their profession or their position.

On the other hand, through their economic and professional contribution in the domestic arena, the Bedouin women revive and enhance their status as productive women. Unlike their mothers’ and grandmothers’ generations, whose move to permanent housing cost them their productive roles in the domestic arena – these third-generation women are working academics. Their contribution of professional knowledge and livelihood to the home establishes a spousal-social-community legitimacy for the new working woman model, and economically and financially they become increasingly essential for the social fabric and changing ethno-social reality of the Arab-Bedouin society in the Negev.

The working Bedouin women see their professional role as more than a profession, attaching to it social and feministic values. Most of the interviewees thought their professional roles are needed by society and have a social, community, and spousal impact. As Bedouin women who identify with the pain of fellow women, or have suffered such themselves, they view their professional role as an opportunity for social and ethnic change. The more similarities there are between the family and professional role, the more significant is the mutual effect.

The literature also refers to the importance of the labor market in creating financial, psychological, and social resources. These are provided to the family and benefit the community. For the Bedouins, they bear great importance as there are insufficient numbers of Arab-speaking working women who can bridge the language and cultural gaps and

provide care for the Bedouin community, especially for its women. An increased awareness of the equal importance of both roles will amplify their influence and further recruit the professional role towards a change in the family arena, so their choice of profession and role stems from a thinking that the role/profession challenges social patriarchal norms in Bedouin society.

Hence beyond a professional mission, the professional role is also perceived as a social, feminist, and community mission, as well as a part of the personal identity among the Bedouin women. The professional arena establishes not only their professional identity, but also their personal identity as feminists. The concept of profession as an inseparable component of their personal identity (the personal is the professional and the professional is personal) is an important resource which they could apply to question and challenge gender, ethnic, and tribal power relations. The profession or employment are thus becoming a platform on which the working Bedouin women establish subjective identities that challenge the power relations and push back the colonial state’s attempts to implement practices that fixate gendered and discriminated representation and identity.

Ultra-Orthodox Women's Integration into Higher Education and the Workplace

Dr. Varda Wasserman, the Open University of Israel

Dr. Michal Frenkel, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Purpose and contribution of the study

The integration of the Haredi (or ultra-Orthodox) population, and especially, the integration of Haredi women, into the Israeli labor market is one of the main challenges facing society and the economy in Israel. In view of the centrality of religious studies among the men of this community, and the typically higher number of children in the family, the ability of ultra-Orthodox families to rise above the poverty line depends to a great extent on women's income-earning ability. In recent years, the Haredi community increasingly recognizes the importance of acquiring higher education in required and rewarding professions to women's improved earning capacity and ability to earn relatively high wages, provided that their faith and religious observance, along with other community and family norms, are not compromised. Subsequently, more women are learning and entering new fields of interest, including high-tech and engineering, areas that many in the Haredi community consider secular.

The integration of Haredi women into the secular higher education system, however, as well as into secular organizations in education and labor, encounters difficulties on both sides. One of the main factors barring Haredi women's access to higher education and to work in secular (or separate) organizations relates to these organizations' spatial nature. Despite the great importance of this aspect, studies aimed at identifying the unique needs of Haredi women in terms of the organizational-physical work environment have yet to be conducted.

This study examines the attitudes and experiences of ultra-Orthodox women with regards to their physical environment in the educational and employment organizations in which they study and work.

The issue of space is central to the discussion of Haredi women's integration into the labor market and academic studies, as it influences not only their performance and earning ability, but also their willingness to be integrated into them. Despite this, the issue has been little researched, and the degree of suitability of the organizational space has not been examined in light of the unique needs of Haredi society in general and Haredi women in particular. Based on recent theories about the influence of space and organizational aesthetics on the work performance of members of different social groups within the organization, the present study offers a gender-spatial analysis of two institutions of higher education and four high-tech organizations in which Haredi women are integrated.

The research method

The research is based on a qualitative method particularly suited to the study of space. Based on an interpretive-constructional research paradigm, we examine the perspective of users of the space – with the assumption that this perception is especially suited to understanding the meanings assigned to their environment and their integration possibilities into it. To this end, we conducted 80 interviews – 40 with Haredi female high-tech employees and 40 with Haredi female college students – and several observations at each of the study's sites (two colleges and four high-tech organizations, in some of which the women are integrated in the workspace and in some of which they are separated).

Main findings and their significance

Analysis of the collected data highlights several relevant research directions, presented below in four central themes:

The politics of visibility

The first theme focuses on spatial arrangements in high-tech organizations and how these spaces are shaped to enable the presence of Haredi women within secular work spaces.

An analysis of the findings reveals that Haredi employees' interpretation for the spatial practice of open spaces is intersubjective, and relates both to the organization and to the internal dynamics among the women themselves. Clearly, Haredi women tend to accept Halachic interpretations of the advantages or disadvantages of working in such an environment and of its benefit or disadvantage for their ability to maintain religious values in a mixed working environment.

They are visibly identifiable and, in the distinctly workaholic culture of their workplace, are perceived as loyal first to their family and community. In addition, their very choice of employment in a mixed and secular environment gives rise to a certain threat to their religious and community identity. To address these issues, Haredi women employ three spatial strategies enabling them to cope with conflicting pressures and to preserve their religious identity without compromising their image as productive workers:

- 1. Visualizing loyalty:** They use space to demonstrate their loyalty and commitment to their employers. Although they do not conform with the "ideal type" of high-tech employees, who devote most of their time to work, they still feel the need to exhibit loyalty and accessibility to work. Therefore, they do not engage in chatting with colleagues, they refrain from eating lunch or drinking coffee with colleagues, they do not place personal phone calls, and report any irregularities in working hours. The open space plan (cubicle) and the employees' visibility in this space enable them to present this commitment effectively.
- 2. Visualizing piety:** Many of the workers see work in a cubicle as an ideal solution for their needs. It presents no risk of being alone with a man, and it is easier for the organization to place one or two women in a cubicle, creating a gender-segregated work area without requiring the employee to be away from her team or completely cut off from organizational dynamics. The exposure to constant supervision is perceived by some women as an advantage that prevents them from being exposed to temptation or suspicion of surfing the Internet while at work or engaging in other inappropriate

activities. They feel that because of their visibility in the space, they can gain legitimacy from both the rabbi supervising them in the organization itself, and from their husbands and their community.

3. **Visualizing distinctiveness:** A third spatial strategy adopted by Haredi women relates to presenting their distinction and distinguishing themselves from the secular co-workers: they insist on separate spaces and some clearly prefer not to work in open cubicles because of the feeling that these are exposed to the gaze of men; they make sure there are clear distinctions between them and their secular colleagues and do not engage in small talk with them, including exchanging greetings; they completely refrain from attending work-related social functions, and more.

Colleges as an intermediate space

Several academic programs have been established since the end of the 1990s, as part of the effort to integrate the Haredi population in general and Haredi women in particular into Israel's modern labor market. These programs provide full academic training and degrees in many fields previously closed to the majority of the Haredi population and offer a gender-separated learning environment and rabbinical supervision of the content and conduct of the lessons.

We chose to focus on academic frameworks for Haredi students as a new physical, conceptual, and social space, and to examine the students' experience in it, their perception of the space itself, and the religious and professional identity they form during their participation in this space.

Based on theories relating to space, both in its physical meaning and in its broad metaphysical meaning (i.e., as a social / cultural / intellectual space), we propose a gender-spatial analysis of two institutions of higher learning (the Haredi college in Jerusalem and the Ono College in Or Yehuda), where ultra-Orthodox women are studying, in an attempt to analyze their unique experiences as users of the space devoted to them. The study examines three conceptual spaces – a geographical space, a social space, and an intellectual space – through which we explore the college as an intermediate space in which a unique encounter takes place between the secular and ultra-Orthodox worlds; a space of encounter and synergy but also of a clash between the Haredi world and the secular / academic world.

In this relatively protected space, students simultaneously experience the blurring of boundaries between the community in which they grew up and the secular world that is foreign to them, and also the constant construction of borders between the ultra-Orthodox and secular, between religious devotion and pragmatism, and between various religious streams. The protected physical and intellectual space created by the ultra-Orthodox colleges offers students constant encounters and friction with the outside world, compelling them to reexamine their identity and sharpen their commitments both in the context of the ultra-Orthodox world they came from and the professional world which they wish to join. The group experience in this space enables female students, sometimes with the help of faculty members, to construct ways of coping with the need to bridge the segregated community life and employment in gender integration conditions, to examine and define patterns of behavior they perceive as normative for Haredi women in a mixed environment, and to form a system of expectations and justifications that will accompany them through their encounters with the employment world outside their communities, without seeing them as undermining their Haredi identity.

Work-family relations: Moving between private and public spaces

A third theme emerging from the findings is the array of family-work relations and the transition between private and public spaces. Typical patterns of integration between work and family are suited to families with very specific social characteristics (white, middle class, two-salaried with a main wage earner). Our research seeks to shed light on families with different needs and a different structure from cultural and class aspects, and to develop work-family integration patterns suitable for such families. The main challenge here is taking into account power relations at home, in the workplace, and in the community as we examine Haredi employees' ability to conduct unique negotiations on organizational arrangements for integrating work and family.

The findings of the study show that ultra-Orthodox women must conduct complex negotiations on family-work arrangements in a particularly demanding work environment, while maintaining their distinct identities. The main strategies applied in this context are:

1. **Shorter work days** – Haredi employees do not exceed eight working hours; they do not take work home; as they do not have access to Internet at home, they cannot – and are not expected to – work beyond normal working hours. In addition, they make a point of separating the private home space from the public-occupational space, and there is no spatial or practical evidence of blurring boundaries, as is common among other employees.
2. **Accessibility of husbands and rabbis to the workplace** – Many employers provide the husbands of the Haredi employees entry permits to the workplace, which is usually not accessible to the spouses of secular workers. Rabbis are also authorized to act on the organization's grounds in order to monitor modesty and to preserve the rules of Internet use. Their presence in the organization makes the Haredi employees' unique religious identity present and separated from other employees in the workplace and enables presenting the Haredi women in the organization with different occupational requirements.
3. **Greater involvement of fathers in childcare** – In ultra-Orthodox society, childcare is perceived as an exclusive maternal function. But the vacations in high-tech are not coordinated with school vacations, and men who study in the Kollel have greater flexibility in planning their schedules; these facts require the men to take a more significant part in caring for the children, including bringing them from kindergarten of school, preparing food, helping with homework, and performing other home roles. These arrangements are kept private, inside the home and away from the public/community eye, which does not approve of them.
4. **Tolerance of frequent maternity leaves** – Haredi women take maternity leaves of 14 weeks almost annually. While typically organizations have low tolerance for such long and frequent absences, in this case, the organization hires additional women employees (130% of the workforce, assuming that 30% are on maternity leave at any given time) and practices of collective job sharing are common.
5. **Organizational recognition of the advantages of employing Haredi women** – Alongside disadvantages stemming from the clear boundaries separating work from family, advantages of employing Haredi women are multiple: Their wages are lower, they are motivated to learn the work and are accustomed to learning, they are highly loyal to the organization, and they do not tend switch jobs as frequently as secular employees.

Therefore, the organization does not attempt to impose on them the same “masculine” work norms that are more common in the case of secular women, who are required to meet the same standard as men.

These findings suggest that paradoxically, Haredi women, who come from a disadvantaged and excluded social group, are more successful in achieving a sustainable family-work balance, succeeding where other women fail. The reasons for this are varied and include the exchange of wages for convenient work conditions; cohesion and solidarity with respect to the community, which is reinforced by the rabbis and their representatives within the organization; cross-subordination to rabbinical and professional supervision; governmental arrangements that back organizations that integrate ultra-Orthodox women. As a result, despite their double exclusion, as women and as members of religious society, these women conduct a more successful negotiation about their status in the organizational space and in the domestic sphere.

Ultra-Orthodox women – agents of change or gatekeepers?

Based on the thesis of Haya Gilboa (advisor: V. Wasserman)

Gilboa examined whether, and to what extent, Haredi women employees in the high-tech industry act as agents of change or preservation in Haredi society. She describes how they cope with the day-to-day contact with the work ethics of the secular world and the employment market, which drives them to self-exert restrictions, control, and constant judgment at every step in their work.

An analysis of the findings shows that Haredi women’s entry into the secular space is a complex process community-wise, creating a certain amount of fear both among community leaders and among the women themselves. Gilboa points to four central aspects shaping the new reality created in the encounter between the Haredi women and the secular working space:

1. The strict rabbinical supervision within the organization's perimeter, determining the rules of their conduct and boundaries of interaction with the environment.
2. The workers’ terms of employment, as reflected by basing the wages on a system of agreements and by the merger of interests between the employers and the rabbis, each side trying, for its reasons, to maintain a low level of wages among the workers.
3. The attitude of the employee’s family towards her working in a high-tech company, which determines her ability to cope with social pressure or criticism.
4. The challenges and opportunities presented to the Haredi women in the working environment, requiring them to continuously set limits for themselves and stretch existing limits, making decisions related to Jewish religious law or cultural matters on a daily basis.

In facing these aspects, Haredi high-tech employees adopt different strategies to navigate between their Haredi identity and the opportunities for personal and professional development and empowerment offered by the workplace. The result is not uniform, as there is a high degree of heterogeneity among the Haredi employees themselves, with different and even conflicting voices presenting a multiple-value position on change. While some attest to an open and pragmatic approach toward their new workplace and the opportunities

it incorporates, others say that the friction with the unfamiliar world leads them to conservatism and seclusion. Between these two outlooks are the interviewees who adopted an intermediate approach, of selective and cautious culling of work practices and new lines of behavior.

Gilboa points to three main types of this encounter: Greater strictness and religiosity; pragmatic choice and selective adaptation of content and values they seek to adopt; adoption of new ideas of self-realization, career, aspiration for high earning – all at the expense of old values of separateness and alienation from the outside world.

Conclusions and recommendations

Haredi colleges are at the same time both protective and offer students the opportunity to get used to the world outside the community in which they grew up. Their geographic location outside Haredi neighborhoods is instrumental to such gradual exposure, and should be preserved.

The findings show that in high-tech organizations, employees’ demand for separate spaces diminishes wages, and that employers link integrative work spaces to promotion and higher, more industry-typical wages. Furthermore, women’s wages are often diminished as a result of the pressure exerted on them by community leaders, who are prepared, in the framework of their negotiations with potential employers, to “sacrifice” women’s wages and working conditions in return for maintaining control of their lives in the workplace as well, and in exchange for the employers’ agreement to also employ Haredi men as kashrut supervisors. Even though the community leaders’ involvement in the workplace enables them to operate as a professional union and gives them bargaining power, many of the women develop, over the years, hostility towards ultra-Orthodox establishment that keeps them behind, in terms of salary and professional achievement.

Therefore, we recommend to continue working with the community and its leaders to improve the bargaining power of the workers vis-à-vis the employers, so that they will not have to compromise their earning level in return for the spatial conditions they require. We believe that working with the community’s central agents should ensure fair working conditions – and not just protection and separation. At the same time, action should be taken to reduce the resistance of project leaders in high-tech to integrate Haredi women into the workforce, and to enable those employees who so wish, to work in mixed spaces, as the study findings indicate that the women themselves do not see their integration into the secular environment as a risk to their religious devotion.

Haredi women’s entry into high-tech companies in organized groups, and not as individuals, serves to alleviate fears and opposition – both on their part and on the part of community leaders; therefore, this direction should be further pursued.

The state invests considerable funds on encouraging Haredi employment. Following a policy change in recent years, there is an increasing effort to integrate Haredi men at work, curtailing the investment in integrating Haredi women. Our findings show that the integration of Haredi women into the modern world of work, with its possibilities of promotion and higher earnings, has wide environmental impact. It brings about norm changes and increases gender equality inside the Haredi family, increases the participation of Haredi men in caring

for their children, and influences the integration of the next generation into higher education and the labor force. Therefore, we deem it important to continue to extensively support the education of Haredi women and their employment in rewarding jobs, such as those in the mixed high-tech industry.

Finally, the current study enabled various Haredi women to voice their opinion regarding their spatial needs in work and studies. Many of the interviewees sought to adapt the space to their religious needs and less to aesthetic preferences. Yet such adaptations result in social and professional isolation; thus, it is important to maintain high levels of sensitivity, because if the possibilities remain open for them, they will be able to preserve their way of life beyond the separate arenas.

Combining Education and Work among Israeli Students

Prof. Rachel Gali Cinamon, Tel Aviv University

Purpose and contribution of the study

From an early age, humans hold multiple social roles. Youngsters' roles within the family (as children, siblings, grandchildren) are later joined by learning, leisure, and community roles, and, in later stages of development, work joins the array of roles that form an individual's way of life (Super, 1990). The simultaneous integration of several social roles, which compete for the individual's time and energy resources, concerns numerous theoreticians and researchers, most of whom focus on adults and the work-family interface (see Frone, 2003).

The combination of higher-education studies and paid work has long been identified as a growing global trend among higher-education students ("students") from diverse socio-economic backgrounds. However, the implications of combining two demanding roles has not received ample attention in research.

Existing research focuses mainly on high-school pupils, with complex and inconsistent findings regarding the results of the combination of the two roles. Few studies have examined the work-study combination among students. As young adults, students aspire to greater economic independence than adolescents; taken together with the temporal proximity of this stage in life to the adult labor market, this questions our ability to infer from findings of research examining work-study combination of adolescents unto students.

The vast majority of the existing research concerning students focuses on the relationships between paid work, on the one hand, and academic achievement and performance, on the other, and even within this age group, the main focus is on the negative aspects of the integration of the two central roles of student and employee. Relevant research on students is also deficient, especially from the theoretical framework, and it is not clear whether combining the two roles creates pressure that impairs students' academic functioning and mental health – or perhaps, contributes to professional development (e.g., acquisition of various skills such as self-knowledge and career orientation) and positive experiences that benefit academic achievement, and which mechanism explains such positive and negative outcomes.

According to working students' reports, the perceived stress and workload was found to be surprisingly related also to greater efficiency and self-efficacy. It seems that in view of their many tasks, managing their integration contributes to students' more effective time use and adherence to specific educational and employment tasks, helps some to develop new skills, enhances their understanding of the professional world, and increases their self-confidence. Moreover, even though the experience of the working student is often a stressful one, it does not necessarily affect the level of satisfaction with the individual academic and overall student experience.

The findings of the studies presented above point to a number of shortcomings that undermine our understanding of working students' experience. The first of these is related to a theoretical framework that would enable a simultaneous consideration of the different outcomes of role-blending and suggest a mechanism through which these come to be. The second shortfall stems from the fact that most of the existing research addressing the work-study combination ignores the possible implications of a students' individual set of social characteristics, such as gender, status, and ethnicity on their ability to combine the two roles. These characteristics were found to be important variables in explaining variance in the ability to blend work and family roles (see, for example, Cinamon & Rich, 2010), and there is a reasonable basis to assume that they may also explain the variance in study-work interfaces.

The present research attempts to narrow these conceptual gaps, taking into consideration the cultural contexts that influence how people combine roles, and the distinct influence of unique antecedents that affect aspects of conflict and enrichment in the combination of work and studies in different cultural groups. It focuses on young Israelis (Jews and Arabs) from various economic settings and different religions in exploring aspects of conflict and enrichment in the employment of students in Israel.

The objectives of this study are to examine the application of an empirical model, used in research on work-family relations, into research on work-study relations. The model examines the extent to which personal and environmental factors can be used to explain variations in conflict and enrichment relations between studies and work among young people from various economic settings and different religions (recent studies point to the importance of understanding cultural contexts that influence the way people combine roles, and the distinct impact of unique antecedents affecting aspects of conflict and enrichment in the combination of work and family among different cultural groups.) In addition, the results of the conflict and enrichment relations between studies and work on academic achievements, future educational programs, occupational programs, and mental well-being are examined in a population of Israeli students from different cultures and from various economic settings.

The research method

In order to narrow the theoretical and empirical gaps, a mixed method of study was designed. Quantitative study participants were 661 Israeli students aged 19-35. 357 (54%) of them are women and 304 (46%) are men. In terms of religious affiliation, students included a majority of Jews (82%), 9.5% Muslims, 2.6% Christians, and 2.4% Druze (the rest did not mention their religion). Most of the participants were born in Israel (85%); others – in the former Soviet Union (8.3%), in European countries or the United States (5.1%), or Africa (0.6%). Most participants were single (60.4%), 21.5% were involved in a romantic relationship, and 18% were married. Participation was voluntary and anonymous.

The research population consists mostly of university students (92.3%), while the rest were college students. The majority (79%) were bachelor's degree students, 20% were master's degree students, and six (0.6%) were PhD students. Study fields – 26.8% social sciences, 17.9% engineering, 17.5% humanities, 11.3% life sciences, 10.6% exact sciences, or medicine (six study participants); the rest of the participants combined programs.

All study participants are students who work in parallel to their studies, investing 8-200 hours per month in their work ($M = 68.81$; $SD = 49.17$). Most held a single job, with 21.8% working in two jobs, and 4.5% – in three. Most respondents (73%) describe their work during the study as permanent employment. Almost one-third of the sample participants began their work prior to their academic studies. 72.6% of the participants describe their work as related to their academic field, 14.5% describe the work as related to certain aspects of their studies, and 12.6% find their work unrelated to their studies.

More than half of the participants are children of parents with academic degrees and nearly one-third of the sample are first-generation higher education. With regards to their families' economic situation, 7.3% of the students indicate a well above-average situation, 29.6% – above average, 35.2% – average, and 17.4% stated that their family's economic situation is below average.

Financial support provided by the parents (measured on a five-point scale, from 1 = no financial support to 5 = substantial support): Participant distribution is as follows: 17.1% receive no financial support (1); 29.2% receive some financial support (2); 25.1% receive average support; 17.4% receive good financial support (3); and 11% receive substantial support (5).

Work-study interface scale: Aspects of conflict and enrichment between work and studies were examined using tools developed specifically for this study, based on the work-family conflict scale and the work-family enrichment scale (Cinamon, 2015; Cinamon & Rich, 2002; Markel & Frone, 1998).

The participants in the qualitative study were 20 working students. During the interviews, the students were asked to discuss their current lives as working students, with follow-up questions, for example, about the main issues they had recently dealt with and their strategies of coping with them.

Interview content analysis indicated three main categories that describe the student experience in Israel today. The first category related to the importance attributed by students to the roles of study and work. Two types of students were identified – those who attach high importance to studies and low importance to work, viewing work as a necessity that at times impairs their ability to study; and those who attach high importance to their work and view the studies as a necessity. The second category focuses on the benefits and costs involved in being a working student. It became clear from the interviews that the experience of the working student combines aspects of conflict that lead to stress, frustration, and little investment in studies and/or work, but also enrichment that leads to enjoyment, interest, and a sense of worth. These aspects occur simultaneously in participants' descriptions. The third category referred to the environmental context that affects the work-study combination experience, and included relationships with parents and employers, colleagues and friends from school, as well as the type of work.

The variables examined include the following:

- Study-work conflictual relations: The extent to which work and studies negatively affect one another
- Study-work enrichment: the extent to which work and studies enrich and improve each other
- Participants' attributions of importance to work roles
- Social support from three sources: family, friends, and significant others.
- Study plans – the extent to which the student intends to pursue the studies (according to a scale wherein 1 = plans to leave; 2 = often contemplates leaving; 3 = seldom contemplates leaving; 4 = plans to complete the studies.)
- Employment plans – the extent to which the student intends to persist in his/her work (with a similar 1-4 scale.)
- Psychological health – life satisfaction scale and depression as measured by the Center for Epidemiological Studies Depression scale (CES-D)

Main findings and their significance

Our findings indicate that conflict and enrichment aspects co-exist in the experience of working Israeli students. The combination of these two roles in young adulthood incorporates aspects of enrichment, which have positive implications for student functioning, as well as aspects of conflict, with negative implications. These contrasting aspects exist simultaneously and have unique antecedents and specific outcomes. The interviewees reported such enriching aspects as interest, a sense of worth and independence, in addition to conflictual aspects of stress, pressure, fatigue, and low investment in studies. The research model examined here also indicates the distinct and simultaneous existence of conflictual and enriching aspects.

We examined the applicability of Frone's theoretical model (Frone, 2007), which serves many studies on family-work interface, in examining students' study-work interface. Our findings indicate that the model is indeed also suitable for young adults. Analysis of the model's structural equations yielded good adjustment indices, indicating that, as among adults, in young people personal variables of attributing importance to the work role, social support, financial support, and working hours affect aspects of conflict and enrichment in combining work and study roles. These aspects have specific outcomes for studies (i.e., plans to continue studying and grades), and for mental health (depression). This model was found to be valid in both men and women and for Israeli Jewish and Arab students. Frone's model, as an empirical model derived from theoretical approaches, points to the importance of examining interfaces between different life roles while addressing both their positive and negative aspects simultaneously. The model clarifies the mechanism for the positive and negative outcomes reported in research. These outcomes are mediated through conflict and enrichment between the roles. Especially in light of the paucity of guiding theoretical models in this area, our findings point to the relevance of the model in the continued investigation of the field.

The model points to several important antecedents in studying the interface between studies and work. First among these is the importance attributed to the work role. As with adults, for students, assigning high importance to the role of the worker influences how life roles are combined. Both cultural and gender differences were found in this aspect. This variable of attributing high importance to the work role among Jewish men is associated with high levels of both conflict and enrichment; among Arab and women participants, it is associated only with enrichment.

Working hours are an important antecedent in explaining aspects of conflict between studies and work. This variable was significant among Jewish and Arab participants and among men and women.

Social support is an important antecedent in explaining the variance of the work-family interface (Cinamon and Rich, 2010) and the study-work interface. We found that social support contributes to creating enrichment relations between studies and work. This antecedent was not found to be significant among Jewish male participants; in other words, social support positively influences aspects of work-study enrichment especially among women and Arabs. It is interesting to note that for adults, social support reduces conflict and intensifies enrichment, while for working students, social support is associated with enrichment alone.

Economic support was found to reduce levels of conflict but also levels of enrichment for working students. An explanation of this interesting finding may be related to the aspirations of young adults to feel financially independent (Arnett, 2004). It can therefore be assumed that when young people receive financial support from their parents, they do not experience the enriching aspects of being student workers because this support undermines their sense of financial independence. The support helps reduce conflicts, but undermines the ability to appreciate the benefits of combining life roles, such as economic self-reliance.

In this context, it should be noted that among Arab participants only, economic support was associated only with a decrease in aspects of conflict – without a decrease in aspects of enrichment. This finding may be related to the fact that they are a more traditional group than their Jewish counterparts, and the very fact that they go to study at a university far from their home area increases their sense of independence, which is not based solely on economic self-reliance. Therefore, when they receive support from their parents, they apply it to reduce the experience of conflict, and their sense of independence (founded on their living away from home and in a large Jewish city) is not impaired and does not lower enrichment levels.

The results further indicate that for men, the conflictual relations between studies and work are more extensive than for women. Aspects of conflict between studies and work negatively affect men's grades, their plans for continuing education, and are positively associated with high depression levels. In contrast, for women, conflictual aspects between the roles do not affect grades, but do affect their future study plans and levels of depression. Aspects of enrichment, on the other hand, affect only the grades in men, while in women – also further study plans.

The differences between Jewish and Arab students in the antecedents and outcomes examined in the research model further support the claim of the importance of culture to the processes of individual career development. Professional, educational, and family choices

are interwoven into the fabric of an individual's cultural life, nourishing and nourished by the values of their culture.

The findings of this study provide a stable empirical framework for further research on student employment. It is important to examine the contribution of additional personal variables, such as personality traits. These were found to be meaningful in studies of family-work relations and are most likely significant also to understanding the study-work interface. One environmental variable possibly associated with the study-work interface is the academic support provided in the higher-education institutions. Social support in the work environment (from supervisors and colleagues) has been found to be an important antecedent in the family-work interface (see Cinamon & Rich, 2010); academic support should be examined for its potential similar contribution to the study-work interface.

One practical question related to student employment is whether it is advisable and desirable to encourage students to work during their studies. The findings of this study underscore the importance of student employment. Enrichment aspects arising in the interviews and questionnaires point to a positive potential in combining work and study roles, as it helps create a sense of worth, stimulate interest, acquire skills and professional experience, improves grades, and encourages working students to pursue further studies. However, it is important to note that this recommendation is not a sweeping one and is linked to the number of working hours. The more hours a student works, the less benefits there are in combining work and studies. Furthermore, available social support resources were found to be an important antecedent that should be nurtured and preserved in the context of recommending the studies-work combination to young adults.

This recommendation does not cancel the need for financial support and assistance for young people. The various facets of economic support should be noted: while reducing work-study conflict levels, it also compromises the ability to experience enrichment.

These recommendations are in line with the Positive Youth Development approach, which emphasizes the future productive capacities of young people based on their current ability to contribute to society and fulfill several roles simultaneously (Damon, 2004). Young people's recognition of this ability may, according to this approach, enhance their resilience and direct them to a route of continued success and contribution (Mahoney, Larson, Eccles & Lord, 2005).

The findings also point to the importance of providing differential recommendations. It is apparent that young men who attach high importance to the work role may experience higher levels of conflict, and therefore it is recommended that they be made aware of the costs involved in combining roles and ensure that they develop support networks for themselves.

The question of combining roles in young adulthood was found to be third in the order of issues concerning young people (Cinamon and Rich, 2012). It is recommended that counselors at young adults' centers, as well as academic advisors at colleges and universities, who talk to their young students about educational and employment choices, would encourage them to combine studies with work and help them examine the number of working hours appropriate for them and how they can recruit social and financial support. It is also possible to convey the findings of the current research to them, either directly and/or as a short publication in the young adults' centers' website.

The Long-Term Effects of Student Participation in Scholarship Programs that combine Social Activism

Prof. Daphna Golan, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Dr. Limor Goldner, University of Haifa

Purpose and contribution of the study

This study examined how young male and female graduates in Israel remember the experience of their social activism as college and university students, and how this experience affects them, 5-10 years after completing their studies. Especially, how such programs promoted the willingness of graduates to serve as active citizens following the completion of their studies as they become young adults. The study also attempted to examine the long-term effects of various models of civic engagement programs, with reference to the frameworks of activism and supervision. The two main models that were examined were the model of individual activism and individual mentoring, versus the model of group activism and group supervision. Finally, the study attempted to examine whether there are differences in how the activities affected graduates from different demographic backgrounds.

The research method

The research was conducted during 2014-2015. The research partners were PERACH (Hebrew acronym for "tutoring project") and two unique PERACH programs – one which operates in conjunction with AJECC in the Negev, and the second which collaborates with rape crisis and sexual abuse centers. Also involved in the research were the Unit for Social Engagement at Ben-Gurion University, the Unit for Social Engagement at The Hebrew University, and the Unit for Social Engagement at Sapir Academic College.

The study included 816 graduates of the Hebrew University, Ben-Gurion University and Sapir Academic College who were active five to ten years before the study. The graduates answered questionnaires about their perceptions of their civic engagement, the degree of their current civic engagement and activity, and the quality of the training they received. In addition, we explored with them the significance of their activities and the importance of the support and supervision they received.

We conducted 57 semi-structured in-depth interviews with graduates. 90% of respondents were Jewish and 10% were Arab. Most of the respondents were born in Israel, 11% – in the former Soviet Union, and the remainder in Europe, the United States, or South America.

Marital status: 59% of the respondents were married with an average of 1.18 children (standard deviation = 1.05, range: 0-6), and the remainder were single. More than half (54%) of the respondents held a bachelor's degree, 44% had a master's degree, and 2% – a professional diploma. Socioeconomically, 6% of respondents described their status at the time as "low", 91% as "medium", and 3% as "high". The average number of years during which the graduates were engaged in social activism as students is 2.62. The respondents included 8% who are former PERACH tutees.

Most of the participants (69%) were active in PERACH; about 10% were active in the Unit for Social Engagement in the framework of group activity; and 11% were active in both PERACH and the Unit for Social Engagement. 6% of the respondents operated within PERACH's Prevention of Violence Project and 4% were engaged in the AJECC project.

Academic affiliation: 53% of respondents studied at Ben-Gurion University, 26% studied at The Hebrew University, and 21% studied at Sapir Academic College. A majority (56%) of the respondents studied social sciences or humanities; 23% studied exact sciences, science, or fields of engineering; 17% studied health and welfare; and the remainder (4%) studied education.

47% of the respondents worked individually and received individual guidance; 23% worked in groups and received individual guidance; 2% worked individually and received group guidance; 18% worked in a group and the received group guidance, and 10% worked both individually and in a group, receiving personal and group guidance. 67% of respondents in PERACH worked individually and the others worked within a group.

The graduates' perception of civic engagement, was assessed using three scales – attitudes towards civic engagement, civic engagement and an ability to influence/skill set – based on the Civic Identity/Civic Engagement questionnaire. The graduates' contribution was assessed by adapting the Volunteer Function Inventory questionnaire.

Affiliation and identification with organizational values were measured through questions about the degree to which graduates had a sense of sharing and belonging to the organization (for example, *the things which the organization I worked at represents are important to me*). The quality of the supervision was assessed through three questions written specifically for this study and designed to evaluate how graduates perceived the contribution of their supervision. Finally, behaviors reflecting graduates' current civic engagement in politics, volunteerism, the environment, and health were measured through 19 questions compiled for this study. Respondents were asked to indicate if they had adopted a certain behavior in the past year or at a specific time (such as *I have commented on political issues on talkback shows/ websites / in posts on social networks / in publications*).

Main findings and their significance

The significance of social activism

In general, the graduates perceive their civic engagement as a positive experience. The graduates who felt that the activity and the supervision they received were substantial, tend to hold more positive attitudes towards civic engagement, and tend to be more active citizens as adults.

However, a positive, pleasant and enjoyable experience is not necessarily meaningful. Meaningful experience is a shaping experience perceived as generating change in a sociopolitical context and characterized by continuity. In the long-term, pleasant memories alone do not necessarily translate into sustained social and political activism, but rather into one-time behaviors of volunteerism.

The graduates described dealing with challenges and unexpected problems which they learned from, which strengthened them and gave them a sense of success during their year of activity. Also, for many of the graduates, the experience of volunteering was the first opportunity they had to meet people from marginalized communities. The initial encounter and subsequent deep familiarity left a strong impression on the graduates, and it is evident that this is an important and significant component of the overall volunteering experience. In addition, the encounter with the other volunteers was also part of the reason the whole experience was perceived as positive, especially for those who, through volunteering, made new friends with whom they remain in contact to this day.

Graduates who worked in a group setting emphasized the process of personal empowerment they went through. They described dealing with challenges and unexpected problems which they learned from, which strengthened them and gave them a sense of success during their year of activity. The interviewees described processes of professional identity formation, acquisition of self-confidence, as well as the development of an ethical-social and political consciousness. Also, we found that a group discussion that integrates the personal level and social contexts of social inequality that the activity was trying to change, led the graduates to feel personal growth and development.

Meaningful supervision: Beyond the acquisition of tools and skills

In the PERACH project – Education for the Prevention of Violence together with the Rape Crisis Centers, students facilitate workshops on the prevention of sexual violence in schools in East and West Jerusalem. Before the start of volunteering, every summer, the rape crisis centers hold an intensive supervision course which is a prerequisite for student participation in the facilitation project at the school. All interviewees who volunteered in rape crisis centers, highlighted the importance and uniqueness of the supervision course, given by professional instructors. They talked about the creation of an intimate and sharing colleague group in the supervision course, which strengthened and supported them throughout the year. The supervision course combines learning content which the students in the schools will facilitate, and the individual process of dealing with complex questions on sexuality, gender and the prevention of violence.

We learned from the interviews that graduates felt a connection between their personal identity and their social activism. They recall their volunteering as a meaningful and empowering experience that challenged them to deal with questions related to personal identity and a wide range of social issues.

Many interviewees reported that through the volunteering they acquired tools and skills that they didn't have prior to volunteering. For example public speaking, the ability to work in a group and cooperate, a self-perception of leadership and professional tools related to supervision and teaching, such as building lesson plans. Program graduates felt that practical skills, such as communication skills, are assets for life; graduates who are teachers today said that the experience of tutoring helped them understand the students in their class. Graduates also reported on how the activism had contributed to their current personal relationships.

Yet meaningful supervision spans much more than this: It links individual experience to social activism, grounded in a broad sociopolitical context. Such supervision gives consideration to aspects of identity development among activists and deals with mediating their initial and continuing encounter with the community, through examining the privileged position of the activists. A combination of the individual and the social broadens the graduates' sense of contribution from the activism, increases the chances for future civic engagement and is likely to develop interaction between the students and the community and their perception of reciprocal contribution.

Therefore, it is recommended to build tutoring programs that allow discussion on the relationship between the community and the students to create models of long-term partnerships in which all partners influence and contribute. It is appropriate to examine options for planning activism and projects in which students learn with and from the community, and do not only see their work as "assisting the weak."

Moreover, meaningful supervision is supervision that takes place before and during activism. The PERACH project – The Prevention of Violence in cooperation with rape crisis centers was found to be the most significant project for graduates. This project is accompanied by a lengthy course, prior to and during activism. In this course, a study group of colleagues is formed, and they indeed stressed the importance of the group's ongoing support. Contrary to this, other graduates noted that PERACH supervision is inadequate. It was also found that the quality of the supervision and professionalism of the PERACH guides affected the degree of gain from the activism. In light of these findings, it is appropriate to expand the number of programs in which students who receive PERACH scholarships will receive prior supervision and ongoing group guidance of professionals. It is appropriate to invest resources in supervision and meaningful professional guidance to afford students meaningful activism.

Correlation between the graduates' experience and their civic engagement today

Graduates who perceived their activity as contributing and meaningful, tended to present more positive attitudes towards civic engagement and today, they tend to more readily participate in political, environmental, and volunteering activities. These findings are consistent with studies conducted in recent years, which show that student participation in social activities during their studies positively impacts their academic achievements, strengthened participants' self-confidence and acquisition of professional and leadership skills. Moreover, social activism has a long-term effect on students, and some maintain that it creates a solid basis for civic engagement later in life. For example, studies suggest a link between participation in social activities during studies and the choice to become a professional service provider, pluralistic views and commitment to actively participate in social justice, beyond the values the students held prior to their activity. Research has shown that programs which combine academic knowledge with social engagement in the community improve students' understanding of the learning materials, create a better

relationship between students and lecturers and between the students themselves, clarify the relevance of academia to the social reality, increase students' motivation to go on to postgraduate studies, and heighten their sense of civil commitment.

Despite the extent of the contribution reported by graduates, the findings of the study indicate that only 34% of all graduates are socially active today on a regular basis, and only 33% of graduates said their current occupation is related to their social engagement as students. In addition, a greater number of graduates who were active in crisis and help centers reported being engaged in social activism today compared to other organizations.

Continuity for creating a meaningful experience

The volunteering students do not engage in social activism during the summer, creating a situation in which the vast majority of scholarship programs are interrupted and often do not continue more than one academic year. Graduates noted that the lack of continuity and fragmented activism caused it to be less meaningful for them. Many of them suggested to consider expanding the activism to include the summer vacation, and many of them asserted that it is difficult to create a meaningful volunteer experience in programs that last only one academic year, and expressed concern for the fate of the activism once their engagement in it is over.

Group supervision vs. individual supervision

Graduates reported that the group of colleagues was an important framework for them in the organizations in which they received group support and supervision. The potential for joint reflection and learning from each other were recalled as being highly meaningful. The group was a framework for exchanging ideas, ongoing learning and strengthening the sense of meaning in the activism. The group was described as a source of support and a place for shared learning, like a "family" space that diminishes loneliness, a place to get advice and share experiences.

Student participation in group supervision and in a long supervision process enabled them to expand their capacity to reflect on their activism and learn about themselves and the community in a sociopolitical context. This finding is also supported in studies on undergraduate courses that integrate activism and combine theoretical content with an opportunity for reflection. These studies asserted the most salient advantages of integrating activism into undergraduate courses action stages, because they reinforce the significance of the activism and give relevance to and clarify the theoretical material taught in class. Students' social activism outside the classroom, yet in the framework of their studies, becomes meaningful when it is taught and explored in the classroom, and the combination of reflection on activism and a theoretical study of the topics that expand relevant knowledge, enriches both the learning and the doing.

A student group of activists has a distinct advantage over individual mentoring, and explains some of the graduates' behavior today. Moreover, group supervision is perceived as more important than group activism, and therefore, it is recommended to explore the possibility of combining activism with models of group supervision. It seems that even when activists participate in individual activism, group mentoring has a distinct advantage over individual mentoring and it has a positive and long-term impact on the graduates.

The encounter between the graduates and the community

For many of the graduates, their volunteering experience was their first encounter with people from marginalized communities. An analysis of the interviews indicated the perception of a relationship of inequality between the graduates and the community. The graduates pointed to gaps between them and members of the community with whom they were engaged. The terminology used by some of the graduates indicated a professional-like attitude of care and assistance. Use of such terminology that positions the volunteer as an outside entity, alien to the community – as one who contributes capabilities and skills to the advancement of others – was also raised in some of the interviews.

While the encounter with marginalized groups was an enriching experience for the graduates, many of them described it as an unprocessed experience, threatening and shaky, which undermined their previous insights about themselves, about other people and the society in which they live. For example, the Jewish graduates indicated that there were surprised and sometimes shocked at the living conditions and difficulties of community members with whom they worked. In light of this finding, the importance of processing the encounter is salient, so that it will not be internalized as a shocking and alienating experience.

Women in general, and particularly Arab graduates benefit the most from their engagement in social activism

Arab graduates felt that they gained from their activism and contributed to the community to a greater extent than the Jewish graduates felt. The quantitative research findings show that Arab graduates believe that they had greater impact on the community through social activism. In addition, we found that compared with the overall experience of the Arab graduates throughout their studies – which in their opinion was also a "tedious", "difficult", frustrating experience – social activism was recalled as being "satisfying", "good", "nice", and "rich". A possible explanation for the higher feeling of gain among the Arab graduates compared to the Jewish graduates lies in the novelty of the activism for the Arab graduates compared to the prior social experiences among Jewish graduates as part of a military, national, or community service.



Edmond de Rothschild Foundation (Israel)

104 Rothschild Blvd. Tel Aviv, Israel

www.rcf.org.il | foundation@caesarea.com